

The Role of the *Journal of College Student Personnel* in the Literature of Various Student Services

Albert B. Hood Division of Counselor Education, The University of Iowa

Sara Beth Hull Career Planning and Placement, Indiana University

Robert A. Mines Division of Counselor Education, The University of Iowa

The *Journal of College Student Personnel*, now in its 20th year, was first published as a professional journal in 1959 as the successor to the *Personnelogram*, a newsletter of the American College Personnel Association. Since its founding, this journal has attempted to publish manuscripts, theoretical or research-based, that make a significant contribution to the literature in the student-personnel field. One measure of the success of this mission is the extent to which articles from this journal are cited by other authors as they review the literature in this field.

During the past 30 years, at least four books have been written that intended to give a general overview of the different specialties in the student personnel field. These books include those by Wrenn (1950); Mueller (1960); Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris (1970); and Packwood (1977). The recent book edited by Packwood reviews the literature in numerous student personnel services and provides citations to examine that were taken primarily from the 10-year period of 1965-74. The Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris book presents bibliographies of recommended journal articles in each of the student personnel specialties published up through 1968, and tends to include articles appearing during the decade leading up to 1968.

By examining the citations from various journals in numerous student service areas from both volumes, it was possible to ascertain the extent to which the *Journal of College Student Personnel* plays a significant

role as a source of literature in a particular specialty. It was also possible to compare these citations with the numbers of articles related to a particular student personnel specialty that were published in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* during the same 16 years, 1959 through 1974. In the books in the student personnel field published before the early 1960s (Mueller, 1960; Wrenn, 1950), many of the references were from books and monographs in other areas and from more widely scattered journals because there were relatively few journals with lengthy publication history in the student personnel field.

RESULTS

The journals that this study showed to be the principal sources of the literature in eight student service areas are listed in Table 1 along with a comparison of the percentages of the total citations received by each journal in the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris and the Packwood chapters that discuss these eight specialty areas. *The Journal of College Student Personnel* received more citations than any other journal in five of the eight student service specialties listed in Table 1. At the bottom of Table 1 is shown the number of articles cited in each book along with the total number of articles in that area that were published in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* during the decade prior to that book's publication.

TABLE 1
A Comparison of Sources of Journal Articles in Certain Student Personnel Specialties

| Journal | Housing | | Financial Aids | | Admissions | | Placement | | Orientation | | Counseling | | Student Activities | | Discipline | |
|---|---------------------------------|----------|---------------------------------|----------|---------------------------------|----------|---------------------------------|----------|---------------------------------|----------|---------------------------------|----------|---------------------------------|----------|---------------------------------|----------|
| | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood | Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris | Packwood |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>J. of College Student Personnel</i> | 35% | 51% | 19% | 18% | 4% | 1% | 7% | 8% | 44% | 46% | 16% | 43% | 29% | 20% | 23% | 29% |
| <i>NASPA J.</i> | 2 | 22 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 3 | 3 | 19 | 2 | 5 | 11 | 40 | 14 | 15 |
| <i>J. of NAWDAC</i> | 18 | 6 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 11 | 12 | 2 | 0 | 9 | 16 | 15 | 13 |
| <i>Personnel & Guidance J. College & Univ. Business</i> | 8 | 5 | 13 | 2 | 25 | 4 | 10 | 6 | 17 | 6 | 19 | 24 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 0 |
| <i>J. of Student Financial Aid</i> | 14 | 1 | 10 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 5 | 0 |
| <i>College Board Review</i> | 0 | 0 | 0 | 41 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| <i>NACAC J. College & University</i> | 1 | 0 | 10 | 7 | 13 | 16 | 0 | 1 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| <i>J. of College Placement</i> | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 8 | 27 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| <i>J. of Counseling Psychology</i> | 1 | 0 | 10 | 5 | 17 | 22 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| <i>Other</i> | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 21 | 24 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 |
| Total Percent | 21 | 15 | 29 | 16 | 32 | 28 | 5 | 20 | 16 | 15 | 38 | 5 | 33 | 24 | 37 | 35 |
| N | 100 | 100 | 99 | 100 | 99 | 100 | 100 | 101 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 101 | 99 | 100 | 100 | 100 |
| Ratio ^a | 105 | 63 | 48 | 111 | 24 | 138 | 69 | 78 | 36 | 52 | 43 | 21 | 45 | 25 | 65 | 62 |
| | 37/41 | 32/68 | 9/14 | 20/20 | 1/15 | 2/29 | 5/5 | 6/6 | 16/17 | 22/22 | 7/43 | 9/80 | 13/24 | 5/27 | 15/15 | 18/35 |

^aJCSP articles cited in Fitzgerald et al./total JCSP articles, 10-yr. period covered by Fitzgerald et al.

Admissions

The *Journal of College Student Personnel* does not play an important role as a source of literature in the admissions field. Only 1% of the articles cited in the admissions chapter in Packwood (1977) and only 4% in the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris (1970) volume were from this journal. In the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris book the source most often cited for admissions articles was the *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, whereas in the Packwood volume the proportion of articles from that journal dropped substantially. Instead, the *National Association of College Admissions Counselors Journal (NACAC J)* became the largest source of admissions articles cited in the Packwood volume. The *College Board Review* published by the College Entrance Examination Board and *College and University* published by the American Association of Collegiate Registrars and Admissions Officers have continued to remain important journals in the admissions field.

During the history of the *Journal of College Student Personnel*, articles dealing with admissions made up approximately 4% of the articles published (Table 2). Although this represents 34 articles dealing with admissions that have been published by this journal, only 3 of these were cited in either

the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris or Packwood books. This is a very small proportion as compared with some of the other student personnel specialties where over one-half, and often almost all related *Journal of College Student Personnel* articles were referenced in these two volumes.

Orientation

Literature in the field of student orientation presents a very different picture. During the years 1965 to 1974, the *Journal of College Student Personnel* published 22 articles dealing with orientation. These 22 articles made up only 3% of the articles published in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* during that period, but they made up almost half (46%) of the articles dealing with orientation that were cited in the Packwood (1977) volume. Every one of the *Journal of College Student Personnel* articles dealing with orientation was cited in the Packwood orientation chapter.

Comparable figures were found for the 1959–1968 period. Seventeen articles related to college student orientation were published, making up 4% of the *Journal of College Student Personnel* articles in that time span. All but one of these articles were listed in the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Nor-

TABLE 2
Journal of College Student Personnel Articles by Subject Area—1959–1974

| Area | Number | Percent |
|-----------------------------|--------|---------|
| Student characteristics | 138 | 16.1 |
| Counseling | 99 | 11.6 |
| Housing | 85 | 9.9 |
| Academic achievement | 73 | 8.5 |
| Professional problems | 68 | 7.9 |
| Administration | 68 | 7.9 |
| College climate | 48 | 5.6 |
| Student conduct | 44 | 5.1 |
| Student activities | 42 | 4.9 |
| Admissions | 35 | 4.1 |
| Fraternities and sororities | 30 | 3.5 |
| Orientation | 30 | 3.5 |
| Financial aid | 28 | 3.3 |
| International students | 21 | 2.5 |
| Academic Advising | 16 | 1.9 |
| Vocational choice | 16 | 1.9 |
| Educational skills | 9 | 1.1 |
| Placement | 6 | .7 |
| Total | 856 | 100% |

ris book and constituted 44% of the journal articles cited there.

Although the proportion of articles dealing with orientation published in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* constituted only 3%–4% of the total articles published, these 3% or 4% constitute almost half of the literature cited in the field of orientation.

In the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris book, the *Personnel and Guidance Journal* was the second most frequently cited source at 17% and the *NAWDAC Journal* third with 11%. In the Packwood volume, the proportion of articles from the *Personnel and Guidance Journal* had dropped to 6%, and it had been replaced as the second most frequent source by the *NASPA Journal* with 19%. The *NAWDAC Journal* continued in third place with 12%.

Housing

One of the student personnel specialties most frequently covered by the *Journal of College Student Personnel* articles is that of student housing, including residence hall advising and programming. Approximately 10% of the articles published in this journal since its inception in 1959 have dealt with housing and this proportion has not changed over the 18-year period. Only the areas of student characteristics and student counseling were the subject of more *Journal of College Student Personnel* articles than those dealing with various aspects of student housing.

Of the 63 housing articles cited in Packwood, 32 of them, or 51%, were from this journal, 14% were from the *NASPA Journal*, 4% were from the *NAWDAC Journal*, and 3% (all prior to 1970) were from the *Personnel and Guidance Journal*. In the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris book, 35% of the 105 journal articles cited were from the *Journal of College Student Personnel* with 18% from the *NAWDAC Journal* and 14% from *College and University Business*. Eight percent of the articles were from the *Personnel and Guidance Journal* because it covers literature prior to 1969 and only 2% from the *NASPA Journal* because of that journal's recent origin.

The *Journal of College Student Personnel* is the chief source of literature dealing with student housing, particularly in the areas of programming, counseling, and advising. It is too early to assess the effect of the Association of College and University Housing Offices' relatively new journal, the *Journal of College and University Housing*, on this specialty. As of yet, it has not become a significant source of housing literature, but if it becomes an important source, then it will likely have an impact on the kinds of articles that appear in the *Journal of College Student Personnel*.

Financial Aids

Changes in the sources of literature in a specialty that result from the establishment of a journal devoted specifically to that specialty are illustrated by an examination of the recent literature in the field of financial aids. About 3% of the manuscripts the *Journal of College Student Personnel* has published deal with financial aids. In the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris (1970) book, these articles represented the largest group of articles cited—19% of the financial aids citations in that book. Other citations were found from a wide variety of journals, particularly the *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, *College and University Business*, *The College Board Review*, and *College and University*. In the Packwood (1977) volume in which the literature review extended to 1975, the *Journal of College Student Personnel* continued to be the source of 18% of the journal articles cited but the *Journal of Financial Aids* was the source of 41% of the citations and all of these had been published since 1971 when that journal was founded. Although the *Journal of College Student Personnel* still contributes substantially to the literature in the field of financial aids, the *Journal of Student Financial Aid* has now become the primary source of journal literature in that field.

Student Activities

The *Journal of College Student Personnel* was the primary source of journal articles dealing with student activities. Of the arti-

cles cited by Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris that dealt with student activities, 20% were from the *Journal of College Student Personnel* and the other two principal sources of student activities items were the *NASPA Journal* with 11% and the *NAWDAC Journal* with 9%. These three journals were also the primary journals cited in the Packwood book but with 40% coming from the *NASPA Journal*, 20% from the *Journal of College Student Personnel*, and 16% from the *NAWDAC Journal*. The *Journal of College Student Personnel* then, along with the other two general student personnel journals, make up the primary sources of journal literature that deal with student activities. The *Journal of College Student Personnel* has devoted approximately 5% of its articles to the student activities area, and these articles make up a substantial proportion of the articles cited in student activities.

Counseling

The literature in the field of counseling covers a very wide area and is found in a large number of different sources that include numerous journals and large numbers of books and monographs. The author of the chapter on counseling in the Packwood book primarily reviewed those journal articles on counseling that dealt with counseling as a college student personnel service. In that chapter 43% of the articles cited were from the *Journal of College Student Personnel*, with 24% from the *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, and another 24% from the *Personnel and Guidance Journal*.

The journal articles cited in the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris book dealt with a wider range of articles concerning counseling; 21% were from the *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 19% were from the *Personnel and Guidance Journal* and 16% from the *Journal of College Student Personnel*. During the period of time covered by these two books, approximately 11% of the articles in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* dealt with counseling. This proportion has remained relatively constant during the life span of this journal and is substantially higher than in either of the

other two general student personnel journals.

Discipline

Sixty-two journal articles published between 1965 and 1974 are cited in the chapter on discipline in the Packwood (1977) volume. Of those 62 articles, 20% had appeared in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* as compared with 15% from the *NASPA Journal*, and 13% from the *NAWDAC Journal*. Eighteen percent were from a variety of law review and legal journals. During the 1965-1974 period, 5% of the articles appearing in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* dealt with student conduct and discipline.

The sources of literature in the field dealing with discipline during that nine-year period generally covered by the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris volume (1959-1968) were similar except that a much smaller proportion were law review articles (6%). Twenty-three percent of the articles dealing with discipline in the Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris book had appeared in the *Journal of College Student Personnel*, with 15% appearing in the *NAWDAC Journal* and 14% in the *NASPA Journal*. Eleven percent of the discipline articles in that volume had appeared in the *Journal of Higher Education*. During the years 1959-1968, 4% of the articles published in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* dealt with student conduct or discipline.

Although the proportion of the total number of *Journal of College Student Personnel* articles devoted to student discipline has been only 5%, these articles make up a quarter of the college student discipline literature cited in the two books. Articles in the journals of the other two broad-based student personnel organizations (*NASPA Journal* and *NAWDAC Journal*) combine for an additional quarter of the cited literature. Thus, approximately half of the literature in the student personnel field dealing with discipline has appeared in these three journals.

Placement

A very high proportion of the literature in the student affairs field that is related to

placement appears in a single source, the *Journal of College Placement*, that accounts for 62% of the journal articles cited in Packwood. Only 12% of the articles cited in Packwood appeared in the general student personnel journals—8% from the *Journal of College Student Personnel*, 3% from the *NASPA Journal*, and 1% from the *NAWDAC Journal*. An additional 8% were from the *Personnel Journal*, and 6% were from a variety of sources.

Only 5 placement articles appeared in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* during the period 1965 to 1974, representing less than 1% of the articles published in this journal. All of these articles were cited in the Packwood chapter on placement. In Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris, references relating to placement were similar to those found in Packwood. Of the 69 articles cited by Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris, 70% were from the *Journal of College Placement*. Only five articles dealing with placement were published in the *Journal of College Student Personnel* during the 1959–1968 period and again, all five articles from that journal were cited in Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris, representing 7% of the articles dealing with placement cited in that book. Ten percent were from the *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 6% from the *NASPA Journal*, and 7% from other journals.

Placement professionals appear to communicate primarily among themselves through the *Journal of College Placement*. A large number of the professionals in the placement field have received their training in areas other than student personnel and perhaps feel little kinship with student personnel workers in other specialties. In any case they do not communicate their ideas and research findings to other student affairs professionals in the generalist journals in the student affairs field.

CONCLUSIONS

In the two books published during the last decade (Fitzgerald et al., 1970; Packwood, 1977) that have provided an overview of the different specialties within the student personnel field, the *Journal of College Student*

Personnel is cited more often than any other single literature source. In five of the eight specialty areas studied—orientation, housing, activities, discipline, and counseling—it was the principal reference cited by these authors.

Within the different specialty areas in college student personnel work, the role in the literature played by the *Journal of College Student Personnel* in each of the specialties varies considerably. In college admissions and college placement, it is a relatively unimportant literature source with various other journals and publications playing primary roles. In financial aid and in college counseling, it plays an important, although not dominant, role as a source of relevant literature. In four areas—orientation, student housing, discipline, and student activities—it plays a major role as the primary source of journal literature in these fields.

In this study several changes that have taken place in the student personnel literature especially during the past decade were noted. In the earlier books including Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris's, the *Personnel and Guidance Journal* was an important reference. The number of citations from that journal dropped substantially, however, in the Packwood book and most of those that were listed there were dated prior to 1971. The *Personnel and Guidance Journal* has obviously become a less important source of relevant articles for the college student personnel administrator since the changes in its editorial policy that took place in the early 1970s and because of the increasing specialization of student services. Several journals that have become important sources of literature in the student personnel field are cited in the Packwood (1977) volume but not in Fitzgerald, Johnson, and Norris (1970) because they were established after that book was written. These include the *NACAC Journal*, which has become an important reference in the admissions field, and the *NASPA Journal*, another more broadly based student personnel journal that focuses particularly on aspects of administration. The *Journal of Student Financial Aid* has very quickly become the primary source of literature in the financial aid field.

As these new journals become better established, they will have an influence upon the kinds of manuscripts submitted to and published in the *Journal of College Student Personnel*. Additional journals that may become established in specialty areas such as student housing, where one has already been started, and perhaps in such fields as student activities and orientation where none currently exist, will also have their impact. It is important, however, that professionals in a college student personnel specialty field read more than just the journal in their own specialty. It is through the broader journals that student personnel professionals in one field have the opportunity to communicate with and learn from those in other specialties. In addition, there is a need for much research in the student personnel field and this research must be written and published for others to read.

Several of the newer specialized journals have shown little interest in this important mission, one that the *Journal of College Student Personnel* has always attempted to fulfill (Hood, 1971) and that will still exist as an important mission in the future.

REFERENCES

- Fitzgerald, L. E.; Johnson, W. F.; & Norris, W. (Eds.). *College student personnel*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1970.
- Hood, A. B. Editor's page. *Journal of College Student Personnel*, 1971, 12, 164.
- Mueller, K. H. *Student personnel work in higher education*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1961.
- Packwood, W. T. (Ed.). *College student personnel services*. Springfield, Ill.: Charles C Thomas, 1977.
- Wrenn, C. G. *Student personnel work in college*. New York: Ronald Press, 1951.

Received 6 May 1978